AUDITOR OF THE COURT OF SESSION

PARLIAMENT HOUSE, EDINBURGH, EH1 1RQ RUTLAND EXCHANGE No. 304 031 225 2595 Extn. 309

Additional Fee

in causa

MSP

Pursuer

against

GHB

Defenders

EDINBURGH. 17th March 1992

The Auditor has been asked to fix the amount of the additional fee for reponsibility awarded to the solicitors for in terms of the Legal Aid (Scotland) (Fees in Civil Proceedings) Regulations 1984, Schedule 1, Section 2, under heads (a), (b), (c), (e) and (f) awarded by the Court by interlocutor of 10th July 1991.

raised an action in the Court of Session, Scotland, on 15th July 1985 against in which he alleged that the doctors responsible for his treatment at Dr. Gray's Hospital, Elgin, had failed to exercise due care, caution and diligence in diagnosis and treatment of a condition which resulted in his death on 20th October 1986 and following upon which his widow, was sisted as Pursuer in the action.

The action was clearly a difficult one. Firstly, the facts were complicated because of "medical history. At the time he first consulted a doctor about his condition in 1978 he was serving in the Royal Air Force and during the relevant period he was seen by a number of medical officers, specialists and his general practitioner who, in April 1979, diagnosed a testicular tumour. Averred that it was not until about July 1983 that he was advised that, had the cancer been diagnosed earlier than April 1979, he would probably have been cured. A question also arose as to whether he had been called for a further medical examination at an earlier stage or having been so called had failed to attend.

The Auditor J. Haldane Tait, 3.S.C.

Principal Clerk Mrs Janet P. Buck

ï

Legal difficulties arose, one of which was whether the case was time-barred ' failure to raise an action within the three year period commencing with the diagnosis of his condition in April 1979, which , and subsequently , sought to overcome by various explanations for no action having been raised earlier. Establishing the facts was made all the more difficult when the principal , died before giving evidence. A further legal question arose in consequence of having married in April 1981 when he was already suffering from a terminal illness and, although she was a "relative" of her late husband within the meaning of Section 1 of the Damages (Scotland) Act 1976, it was contended by the Defenders that she had suffered no loss within the meaning of Section 1 (3) and (4) of the Act. A procedural debate took place on the averments relating to alleged loss which resulted in these averments being excluded from probation. This decision was, however, appealed to the Inner House who decided that the Lord Ordinary had been premature in his decision to dispose of that difficult and novel question on the pleadings alone and the averments were restored for consideration at a proof before answer. A proof took place on 15th February 1991 and lasted in all thirteen days including two days for speeches. resided in Lossiemouth, her solicitors were in Glasgow and they had Edinburgh solicitors to attend to the action in the Court of Session. There were some 900 sheets of productions to be considered, principally medical records. The Pursuer led four medical witnesses in support of her claim, a Consultant General Surgeon from London, a consultant Urologist from Manchester, a Consultant Oncologist from a Consultant Urologist from Glasgow. The Defenders Glasgow and led the evidence of the two doctors blamed by the Pursuer and also the a Professor of Surgery and a Consultant evidence of Urologist in Edinburgh and General Surgeon with

Highland Health Board.

ì

the preparation of the case, involving complicated matters of fact stretching over a period of some thirteen years and they had to achieve a detailed understanding of the pathological condition from which was ultimately diagnosed as suffering and consideration had to be given to medical standards of diagnosis and treatment as then practised. The Pursuer's solicitors had to instruct experts in different fields of medical expertise to advise in the appreciation of the medical records and the reasonable interpretation thereof.

After consideration of all the evidence, the Court found established that

was in possession of sufficient knowledge in November 1982 to
alert him to the seriousness of his condition and that any delay in
treatment would affect the prognosis. Sundry efforts were made by
then solicitors who in August 1983 applied for legal aid. The
Lord Ordinary in his opinion records "That application was not granted
until June 1985 owing to administrative difficulties then facing the Legal
Aid Board." The Court absolved the Defenders on the ground that the action
was time-barred and, after examination of the evidence did not find fault
established.

The foregoing synopsis does not pretend to set out all the facts and various aspects of the case which are much more fully rehearsed and considered in the Opinion of the Court which extends to some 68 pages.

The Auditor, having considered the process and the Lord Ordinary's Opinion and having perused the Legal Aid account running to some 74 pages, fixes the additional remuneration payable to solicitors for their responsibility in the conduct of the case at the sum of SIX THOUSAND TWO HUNDRED AND FIFTY POUNDS (£6,250.00) excluding Value Added Tax.

The Auditor has also beer asked to consider the fee charged by

for attending at Court to give evidence over a period of two days

amounting to £2,000 exclusive of travelling and incidental expenses.

is a Consultant General Surgeon/Senior Lecturer in Surgery, University College and Middlesex Hospitals School of Medicine. He gave evidence on the second and third days of the proof commencing at 3.00 p.m. on the second day and finishing at 3.30 p.m. on the third day.

In this case, the experts had obviously to be sought from outwith the area of Grampian Health Board. The Professor of Surgery at Edinburgh University was enlisted by the Defenders and the Pursuer's advisers were, therefore, obliged to seek the help from elsewhere of a specialist in that field with comparable experience in diagnostic techniques in use at the relative time.

There are no prescribed scales for the allowance of remuneration of expert witnesses and the Auditor understands that the Board did not impose an initial limit of fee in respect of this expert witness. However, solicitors must, in seeking expert advice, ascertain the likely cost of it as much in a legal aid case as in one privately funded. In considering a reasonable daily rate to be allowed for a suitable expert Consultant general surgeon appearing as a witness, the Auditor has consulted with the Royal College of Surgeons. Edinburgh, and, as it has not been shown to the Auditor's satisfaction that it would not have been possible to obtain equivalent expertise either elsewhere in Scotland or in England at a lower cost, he taxes the fee at ONE THOUSAND FOUR HUNDRED AND FORTY POUNDS (£1,440.00) exclusive of Value Added Tax.

AUDITOR OF THE (

AUDITOR OF THE COURT OF SESSION

PARLIAMENT HOUSE, EDINBURGH, EH1 1RQ RUTLAND EXCHANGE No. 304 031 225 2595 Extn. 309

WITNESS FEE

in causa

Pursuer

against

Grampian Health Board

Defenders

EDINBURGH. 31st March 1992.

The Auditor refers to his previous Report dated 17th March 1992 and in respect of the two-day Court attendance of the two-day Court attendance of Consultant Urologist, Cheadle, claimed in the sum of £1,600.00 and having heard the solicitor for the Pursuer and the representative of the Scottish Legal Aid Board and having consulted with the Royal College of Surgeons, Edinburgh, taxes the fee at the sum of ONE THOUSAND FOUR HUNDRED AND FORTY POUNDS (£1,440.00) exclusive of Value Added Tax.

AUDITOR OF THE COURT OF SESSION

THE SCOTTISH LEGAL AID BOARD

ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE - CIVIL ACCOUNTS DEPARIMENT PROPOSED SETTLEMENT - CIVIL ACCOUNT

COURT: Court of Session

LOCATION: Edinburgh

LAC effective from 17/12/86 Case Concluded on 12/7/91 Account rec'd cn 20/10/91	PROCEEDINGS TYPE: Reparation								
Name of Solicitor's Firm: Gillan Mackie Account as Rendered NOMINATED SOLICITOR UNITABLE AT CHEMPT VATABLE AF PREVIOUS RATE FROM VAT 8,247.79 Fees 7,375.25 9,077.79 Outlays 7,756.79 989.75 Posts & Incidents 885.05 Counsel Fees (fr.Sc.) 7,950.00 TOTAL AS CIAIMED AS CIAIMED AS CIAIMED AS CHEMPT VATABLE AT PREVIOUS RATE Statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of LAA payment deducted Reference PG Offered 255.153.09 1.004. CORRESPONDENT CHEMPT RATE FROM VAT 1,201.02 Fees 1,169.92 247.60 Outlays 247.60 Outlays 247.60 Outlays 247.60 Outlays 247.60 TOTAL AS In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of 1,592.75 TOTAL AS In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of 1,592.75 TOTAL AS In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of 1,592.75 TAA payment deduct d for the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of 1,592.75 TOTAL AS In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of 1,592.75 Amount offered to local solicitors f1,557.92 Name of Local Solicitor's Firm: Hamilton Burns & Moore ADDITIONAL FEE (WHEME APPLICABLE) (FRE. VAT): \$ £6,250.00 Principal abatements, adjustments agreed subject to Subcommittee approval: counsel f13 day propof 62 page pludgement Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Shr. Counsel Supervisor Manager Applied to Subcontris Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Shr. Counsel Manager Applied to Subcontris Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Shr. Counsel Supervisor Manager Applied to Subcontris Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Shr. Counsel Supervisor Manager Applied to Subcontris Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Shr. Counsel Supervisor Manager Applied to Subcontris Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Shr. Counsel Supervisor Manager Applied to Subcontris Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Shr. Counsel Supervisor Manager Applied to Subcontris Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Shr. Counsel Supervisor Manager Applied	LAC effect	ive from 17/12/86 Case	concluded on 1	2/7/91 1	Account rec'd	on 20/10/91			
Name of Assisted Person: Account as Rendered NOMINATED SOLICITOR CURRENT RATE EXPMET The North Vat The North Va									
NOMINATED SOLICITOR Soli									
NOMINATED SOLICITOR CURRENT RATE EXEMPT 15 % AFFEVIOUS RATE 15 % AFFEVIOUS RAT				Amount offered					
9,077.79 Outlays 7,756.79 989.75 Posts & Incidents 885.05 Counsel Fees (to Sol) 7,950.00 1,186.00 9,692.50 Counsel Fees (F.S.) 7,950.00 1,186.00 TOTAL AS CIAIMED Solicitor's fees of f. Solicitor's Reference PC PC Offered E25.153.09 LOCAL CORRESPONDENT CURRENT RRIE EXEMPT CURRENT RRIE FROM VAT & VATABLE AT PREVIOUS RATE CURRENT RRIE FROM VAT & VATABLE AT PREVIOUS RATE 1,201.02 Fees 1,169.92 247.60 144.13 Posts & Incidents 140.40 Counsel Fees (to Sol) Counsel Fees (to Sol) Counsel Fees (F.S.) TOTAL AS CIAIMED Statutory deduction bas been applied to solicitor's fees of 1,592.75 LAA payment deduct d f. Amount offered to local solicitors f1,557.92 Name of Local Solicitor's Firm: Hamilton Burns & Moore ADDITIONAL FEE (WHERE APPLICARIE) (PRE. VAT): \$ £6,250.00 Principal abatements, adjustments agreed subject to Subcommittee approval: Counsel F720.00 Outlays Expert Witnesses daily rate f400.00 reclaiming motion - polegal aid f180.00 excessive copies of judgment G13 day proof, 62 page judgment Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Ananager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accumits Daily and Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Page first Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Page first Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Proof fee Supert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel P	Rendered	NOMINATED SOLICITOR	VATABLE AT CURRENT RATE						
989.75 Posts & Incidents 885.05 Coursel Fees (to Sol) 7,950.00 1,186.00 9,692.50 Coursel Fees (F.S.) 7,950.00 1,186.00 TOTAL AS In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of 1AA payment deducted COURSET RATE CURRENT RATE CURRENT RATE FROM VAT \$ Amount \$ \$ 25.153.09 \$ 1,201.02 Fees 1,169.92 247.60	8,247.79	Fees	7,375.25						
Coursel Fees (to Sol) 9,692.50 Coursel Fees (F.S.) 7,950.00 1,186.00 TOTAL AS CIAIMED Statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f	9,077.79	Outlays		7,756.79					
9,692.50 Counsel Fees (F.S.) 7,950.00 1,186.00 TOTAL AS CIAIMED Statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f	989.75	Posts & Incidents	885.05						
TOTAL AS CIAIMED 28,007.83 In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of fax payment deducted formers from var and fax payment deducted fax payment fax pay		Counsel Fees (to Sol)							
Salutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f	9,692.50	Counsel Fees (F.S.)	7,950.00		1,186.00				
LAA payment deducted for CORRESPONDENT CURRENT RATE FROM VAT 1,201.02 Fees 1,169.92 VATABLE AT CURRENT RATE FROM VAT 1,201.02 Fees 1,169.92 VATABLE AT PREVIOUS RATE 247.60 Outlays 247.60 Counsel Fees (to Sol) 247.60 Counsel Fees (to Sol) 340.40 Counsel Fees (F.S.) 350.00 TOTAL AS CLAIMED Statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f. LAA payment deduct d f. Amount offered to local solicitors f1,557.92 Amount offered to local solicitors f2,557.92 Principal abatements, adjustments agreed subject Solicitor 7720.00 Outlays Expert Witnesses daily rate f100.00 excessive copies of judgment Counsel f2350.00 To Proof fee Solicitor 62 page judgement Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Aco. units Manager Aco	CLAIMED	statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of		<u> </u>					
1,201.02 Fees 1,169.92 247.60 247.60 Outlays 247.60 144.13 Posts & Incidents 140.40 Coursel Fees (to Sol) Coursel Fees (F.S.) TOTAL AS CIAIMED In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f 1,592.75 Amount offered to local solicitors f1,557.92 Name of Local Solicitor's Firm: Hamilton Burns & Moore ADDITIONAL FEE (WHERE APPLICARIE) (PRE. VAT):	28,007.83	LAA payment deducted		F		£25.153.09			
247.60 Outlays 144.13 Posts & Incidents Counsel Fees (to Sol) Counsel Fees (F.S.) TOTAL AS CLAIMED In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f 1,592.75 LAA payment deduct d f Name of Local Solicitor's Firm: Hamilton Burns & Moore ADDITIONAL FEE (WHERE APPLICAPLE) (PRE. VAT): Principal abatements, adjustments agreed subject Solicitor F720.00 Outlays Expert Witnesses daily rate f400.00 reclaiming motion - no legal aid f180.00 excessive copies of judgment Other significant aspects of case: Productions (903 sheets) 13 day proof, 62 page judgement Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accounts		LOCAL CORRESPONDENT				REVIOUS RATE			
Counsel Fees (to Sol) Counsel Fees (to Sol) Counsel Fees (F.S.) TOTAL AS CIAIMED In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f I,592.75 IAA payment deduct d Remailton Burns & Moore ADDITIONAL FEE (WHERE APPLICAFIE) (PRE. VAT):	1,201.02	Fees	1,169.92						
Coursel Fees (to Sol) Coursel Fees (F.S.) TOTAL AS CIAIMED In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f 1,592.75 IAA payment deduct d Reserved to local solicitors Reserved to Subcommittee approval: Counsel Reserved to local solicitors F1,557.92	247.60	Outlays		247.60					
Counsel Fees (F.S.) TOTAL AS CIAIMED In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of factorial and payment deduct defect to local solicitors for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Total AS CIAIMED In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of factorial fees of fac	144.13	Posts & Incidents	140.40						
TOTAL AS CLAIMED In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of flat payment deduct d flat payment flat pa		Counsel Fees (to Sol)		ii					
CTAIMED statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f. 1,592.75 TAA payment deduct d f. Amount offered to local solicitors fl,557.92		Counsel Fees (F.S.)							
Name of Local Solicitor's Firm: Hamilton Burns & Moore ADDITIONAL FEE (WHERE APPLICARIE) (PRE. VAT):	CLAIMED	statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f	Amount offered to local solicitors £1,557.92						
ADDITIONAL FEE (WHERE APPLICAPIE) (PRE. VAT): Principal abatements, adjustments agreed subject Solicitor F720.00 Outlays Expert Witnesses daily rate f400.00 reclaiming motion - no legal aid f180.00 excessive copies of judgment Other significant aspects of case: Productions (903 sheets) 13 day proof, 62 page judgement Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accounts		LAA payment deducted £							
Principal abatements, adjustments agreed subject to Subcommittee approval: Solicitor f720.00 Outlays Expert Witnesses daily rate f400.00 reclaiming motion - no legal aid f180.00 excessive copies of judgment Other significant aspects of case: Productions (903 sheets) 13 day proof, 62 page judgement Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accounts	Name of Local Solicitor's Firm: Hamilton Burns & Moore								
Solicitor f720.00 Outlays Expert Witnesses daily rate f400.00 reclaiming motion - no legal aid f180.00 excessive copies of judgment Other significant aspects of case: Productions (903 sheets) 13 day proof, 62 page judgement Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accounts	ADDITIONAL FEE (WHERE APPLICAPLE) (PRE. VAT):								
f400.00 reclaiming motion - no legal and f180.00 recessive copies of judgment Other significant aspects of case: Productions (903 sheets) 13 day proof, 62 page judgement Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accounts	Solicitor Counsel								
Productions (903 sheets) 13 day proof, 62 page judgement Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accounts	£400.00 re	claiming motion - no leq	£350.00 To Proof fee						
Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accounts	Other sign	ificant aspects of case:	Bookkeeper						
Sanction for four Expert Witnesses/Snr. Counsel Manager Accounts	Production	s (903 sheets)		Supervisor					
	Sanction for	or four Expert Witnesses	/Snr. Counsel	Accounts		_			

THE SCOTTISH LEGAL ALD BOARD

ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE - CIVIL ACCOUNTS DEPARIMENT PROPOSED SETTLEMENT - CIVIL ACCOUNT

LOCATION: Edinburgh

COURT: Court of Session

PROCEEDINGS TYPE: Reparation									
IAC effective from 17/12/86 Case concluded on 12/7/91 Account rec'd on 20/10/91									
IA Reference No. 3 7 8 0 6 0 2 7 7 8 8 6 Solicitor's IA Code No. 0 3 2 5 5 3									
Name of Solicitor's Firm: Gillam Mackie Name of Assisted Person:									
Account as Rendered			Amount	offered					
Remered	NOMINATED SOLICITOR	VATABLE AT CURRENT RATE	EXEMPT FROM VAT	VATABLE AT P	REVIOUS RATE				
8,247.79	Fees	7,375.25							
9,077.79	Outlays		7,756.79						
989.75	Posts & Incidents	885.05							
	Counsel Fees (to Sol)								
9,692.50	Counsel Fees (F.S.)	7,950.00		1,186.00					
TOTAL AS CLAIMED	In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f	Solicitor's Reference		Amount Offered	£25.153.09				
	LOCAL CORRESPONDENT	VATABLE AT CURRENT RATE	EXEMPT FROM VAT	VATABLE AT PI	REVIOUS RATE				
1,201.02	Fees	1,169.92	7						
247.60	Outlays		247.60						
144.13	Posts & Incidents	140.40	·						
	Counsel Fees (to Sol)								
	Counsel Fees (F.S.)								
TOTAL AS CLAIMED	In the offer the 10% statutory deduction has been applied to solicitor's fees of f	Amount offered to local solicitors £1,557.92							
Name of Local Solicitor's Firm: Hamilton Burns & Moore									
ADDITIONAL FEE (WHERE APPLICABLE) (PRE. VAT): \$ £6,250.00									
Principal abatements, adjustments agreed subject to Subcommittee approval:									
Solicitor £720.00 Ou £400.00 re	tlays Expert Witnesses d claiming motion - no leg cessive copies of jadgme	Counsel £350.00 To Proof fee							
Other sign	ificant aspects of case:		Bookkeepe	r					
Production	s (903 sheets)		Supervisor						
Sanction f	s (903 sheets) of, 62 page judgement or four Expert Witnesses	/Snr. Counsel	Manager Accounts Assessmen	t					